

APPENDIX 1 – CASE STUDIES

CASE STUDY 1: UDZUNGWA MOUNTAINS NATIONAL PARK ICDP

Gender has been a strong focus of the WWF-supported Udzungwa Mountains National Park (UMNP) ICDP in Tanzania since its establishment. Women living in the villages adjacent to UMNP are traditionally of low status. However this is improving slowly and with support from TANAPA (Tanzania National Parks) and WWF, women are forming working groups (there are 13 at present) to perform a variety of activities for conservation and income generation. Increasingly the groups have been self-mobilised and self-formed, and the women have seen the benefits of working together to access resources and support from WWF and donors.

Through a survey carried out by WWF and normal interaction with the community, it was realised that women were lacking skills needed for conservation, organisation, business management, leadership and decision-making as well as the capital for income generating activities. WWF and TANAPA thus considered it crucial to enhance women's capacity through training, awareness raising, and alternative income generation activities.

Before UMNP was established in 1992, it was well known that the communities around the reserve made a living through sales of firewood, charcoal and timber. The establishment of the Park meant stopping these commercial activities. Finding alternative means of income generation was seen as one of the ways to facilitate park conservation.

To address these problems, particularly those related to women, some activities were supported through the WWF Udzungwa Mountains Project. It was expected that addressing these problems would, in turn, make it possible for women to participate fully in conservation activities. These include:

Awareness Raising

The aim of awareness raising activities is to emphasise to women the link between their activities and conservation of the Park. More than twenty-five seminars and workshops on environmental education were organised for community groups in Udzungwa from 1991-2000. In all of these seminars almost half of the participants were women.

Capacity Building

Training for women through programmes, seminars, study and exchange visits focuses on environment, gender and other socio-economic dimensions. Workshops have been carried out on micro enterprise, leadership, women's rights and integrated farming techniques.

Tree Planting and Nurseries

In a bid to provide alternative sources of firewood, WWF established seven nurseries from which women have been taking seedlings to plant in their plots and home compounds. The communities now run the nurseries as commercial enterprises. A total sum of Tshs. 1,700,000/= (US\$ 2,125) was acquired last year. A bank account has been opened to save this money and the signatories are two women and two men. People can be fined for not looking after the seedlings properly. Woodlots have also been established – at present totalling nine - and are owned by nine women's groups. Women are harvesting these woodlots not only for home use but also for sale to companies such as ILLOVO Sugar Co. The money obtained is used to assist with domestic shortages and develop their groups' activities. WWF often acts as a broker between the community and such commercial companies. The woodlot is made up of the following species: *Sena syamea* (a species that sheds toxic leaves which kill the undergrowth); *Cederala odorata*; *Acacia manglum*; *Tectona grandis* (teak); *Tamrindus indica*.

Shallow Well construction

To help women with water access problems and also facilitate nursery activities, WWF has constructed five shallow wells: two in the west and three in the east of the region.

Small Short-term Loans for Zero Grazing with a 'Borrow a Cow, Give a Cow' Scheme.

The scheme has been designed to heighten the standard of living of local communities and improve their nutrition through increased protein consumption in the form of milk. It is also seen as a way of reducing poaching and poverty by offering alternative sources of income. WWF gives a group of women a cow (a Friesian-indigenous cross breed) from which they breed. In addition, some financial support and technical assistance is given for veterinary services and the construction of a shed or pen. Milk is taken and either used for household consumption or sold. For example, from July until December 2000, Msolwa women's group was able to raise a profit of Tshs 337,840/= (equivalent to US\$ 422 00). Half of this profit was distributed to members of the group (10 in all) and the remaining amount was reinvested. Once the cow has produced a female calf, the calf is given back to the project in 'payment', and is then passed on to another group. The original cow remains the property of the first group who can continue to breed from it and either keep the successive calves or sell them.

Some women are now planning to introduce biogas production from the cow dung, and one group has also branched into poultry production.

Integrated Farming Technology

One women's group is being supported in cultivating rice, maize and vegetables and poultry keeping as an intensive integrated farming project. The women contributed 20% of the total costs and WWF provided 80%.

Traditional Irrigation Improvement Scheme in Msosa-West

In 1998 TANAPA and WWF constructed an irrigation system to help women develop onion farming. The scheme is helping both men and women because the village government has established a very good system of plot distribution and water sharing.

Support for Community Initiated Projects (SCIP)

The programme is designed to support communities in implementing development projects such as schools, health centres, teachers' houses and roads. Communities normally initiate the project and approach TANAPA/WWF for technical and material support. About seventeen SCIP projects have been implemented through TANAPA and WWF support.

Village Community Conservation Committees (VCCCs)

Women were also considered in institutionalising community participation in Park management through the creation of Village Community Conservation Committees. In each of the VCCCs there are between two and four women. The representatives are elected by the community and participate on a voluntary basis. Although some of them have taken on leadership roles, others still lack confidence to speak. The role of the VCCCs is to raise awareness on conservation issues, encourage participation in activities, monitor seedling use and assist in the control of poaching and illegal logging. Some are also involved in other activities such as the protection of water sources and village-based beekeeping. The VCCCs act as the link between the people and the park authorities. As the number of VCCCs has grown the need for an umbrella VCCC to coordinate and monitor the activities and participation of all the groups has become evident. This will be established in the near future.

Impacts on the Communities and Women

- The project has reduced - if not solved - some of the communities' problems. These include health, road and education services.
- As a result of strengthened collaboration between the park and communities, forest fires that usually occur during the driest months of the year have been controlled.
- Poaching has been reduced. Records indicate that the number of poachers decreased from 58% in 1999 to 28% in 2000. In general local communities are knowledgeable about the Park and support it.
- Community members are becoming increasingly aware of environmental issues. VCCCs, youths and women groups are becoming active in conservation activities. Women are keen to take up more positions in the VCCCs.
- Training and exchange visits have exposed women and communities to various development activities and have enhanced enthusiasm for development.
- The tree planting programme has reduced the communities' dependence on the Park forest resource by more than half. Without the time-consuming chore of firewood collection, women have acquired more free time, which they now use for other income generating activities.
- People have now started to appreciate the link between conservation and development, especially after attending seminars on environmental education and income generation strategies. The seminars taught them different ways of identifying business opportunities through conservation activities.
- Women enjoy harvesting their plants using and/or selling them.
- Milk and vegetable production has helped to increase the nutrition value and incomes of families within Udzungwa.
- Women feel empowered not only at family levels but also at the society level as they have gained economic power, and freedom to articulate their problems.
- The formation of the various groups provides a number of forums for women to come together, share problems and experiences and support each other.
- The men in the communities support the involvement of women in the various activities because they have realised the benefits. However some women are concerned that as their activities become more economically successful they will be 'hijacked' by more powerful elements in the community, namely the men.

CASE STUDY 2: LUANGWA INTEGRATED CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT PROJECT, ZAMBIA

(Barnes, 2000a)

Introduction

The Luangwa Integrated Rural Development Project (LIRDP) operates in the Lupande Game Management Area (GMA), eastern Zambia. It acts as buffer zone for the South Luangwa National Park (SLNP). The majority of the inhabitants are from the Kunda tribe, which is governed by six chiefs whose positions are matrilineal and held for life. Women, as well as men, may hold senior positions such as heads of villages. However in general, women are subordinate to men. Early marriage is common; women eat separately from the men; they must kneel when presenting something to a man and at meetings women must sit on the floor whilst men sit on chairs. This submissive tradition together with poor education means that women lack self-confidence and take little part in decision-making processes.

In the early stages of the LIRDP a Women's Programme was initiated, a large part of which was conducted through women's clubs. Although not accessible to all women, due to large workload or attitude of both men and women towards them, the women's clubs provided opportunities that were more appropriate to women than whole community meetings for dissemination of information and provision of support specific to women's needs. This included literacy development - vital to women's effective participation in both Education Days and AGMs - and skills and knowledge development for income generation, family health and nutrition. However, by 2000 (the time of this study) there were no specific activities incorporating gender issues within the programme (see Table 1).

LIRDP promotes natural resource management by incorporating Education Days into the Annual Revenue Distribution General Meetings, led by the Community Liaison Assistants (CLAs). Only 40% of local women attend these meetings. CLAs are not formally trained for their roles, which include the delivery of information, the support of groups trying to improve their socio-economic status, and the creation of a sense of partnership between local people and LIRDP. All CLAs are male and as a result the particular needs of women cannot be fully understood or met.

Additionally, Community Based Scouts (CBS) are employed by the local community from their wildlife revenues to implement active wildlife management including the education of the local community. Only three of the 78 CBS are women. As a result there is little encouragement for women to play an active role in the conservation and management aspects of LIRDP. Women believe that initiative and ability to improve their quality of life only comes from others – men, extension workers, NGOs and donors. This means that women do not take responsibility for, or believe that they have the ability to, manage natural resources well. As a result, improved management does not occur unless it is strictly enforced by those with the power to do so (ie Chiefs, LIRDP), or if an outsider with new resources and ideas arrives.

The women in Lupande have seen development projects initiated by external organisations who have brought new technology, techniques and knowledge, but who have failed to transfer appropriate skills in leadership, maintenance and management. As a result when the outsiders leave, so too does the initiative and ability on which the project is dependent. Indeed, this was the case with the establishment and subsequent discontinuation of the Women's Programme, marking the end of most of the 68 women's clubs that had been established.

Such experiences create perceptions that for projects to succeed they depend upon the involvement of people external to the community. Women's attitudes of apathy and dependency are compounded by their traditionally marginalised positions and expected behaviour. They are not accustomed to initiating change in their situation. Women are also concerned about how others will react to them if they behave differently from the norm and take on roles or activities that are not usually perceived as being those of a woman.

Women's Involvement in Incentive Schemes

Incentive schemes can only be successful in promoting sustainable wildlife management if they match benefits to costs and cost bearers. Men and women are likely to bear different costs from wildlife management practices and perceive the benefits provided differently. The principal way in which LIRDP is attempting to create incentives is through revenue distribution, which couples (or re-couples) the interests of local people with sustainable natural resource management, so that it is seen as a valuable land use in the Lupande GMA. Community-based institutions - Village Action Groups (VAG) - have been created to facilitate the use and distribution of revenue from wildlife in the region, with the ultimate goal of enabling communities to manage natural resources.

However, several factors mean that the full value of the benefits resulting from the Project are not felt by women and therefore are not considered by women when judging whether the incentives are sufficient to justify more sustainable natural resource management. Firstly, although allocating a large proportion of revenue to household cash means that community members (including women) have control over what they use it for and it cannot be extracted by Chiefs for their own use, the amount that people receive as individuals is minimal. Women who receive cash (some VAGs only give household cash to household heads and not to all community members) are able to control what they use the money for. It is usually used for household

basics such as grinding fees, soap, salt, or school or medical fees and therefore benefits the whole family. However, the money that men receive is often spent on beer.

Project Stage	Establishment (1986)	Implementation and Review (1986-96)	Rationalisation and Refocusing (1996)	Transition to SLAMU*
Activity relating to women	Women's Programme initiated in 1987 - Nine female extension workers. - Focussed on crop, poultry, vegetable production & home economics. - Over 50 women's clubs with over 1,000 members.	- 68 women's clubs providing forum for family planning info, credit schemes for agriculture, adult literacy classes, siting of wells etc. - Workshop on integration of women into all LIRD - programmes recognising problems of working separating with women.	Mainstreaming of the participation of women through the policy that all sections of the project incorporate gender considerations into all aspects of their activities. Particularly the Community Liaison Section in local level institutional development and administration to employ 30% females.	No specific activities, responsibility for incorporating gender considerations remains with individual sections of LIRD. Lack of benefits flowing to women.

Table 9.1 Stages of Women's Projects, LIRD, Zambia

* SLAMU - South Luangwa Area Management Unit

In addition, much of the benefit that could have been gained through the implementation of projects has not been seen due to poor financial management by the VAG Committees. Furthermore, in some cases, Chiefs have expropriated money from the VAGs for their own use. Finally, funding for men's projects takes preference over women's.

Women's Participation in Decision-Making Processes

Women are under-represented on the VAGs (the main decision-making institutions concerned with CBNRM). In addition, although a good percentage of women attend important meetings such as the AGMs, their contribution and active participation is poor. They are generally excluded from many of the decision-making processes due to traditional power structures and responsibilities, which cause them to lack the confidence and ability to communicate their ideas and perspectives effectively.

The election of women onto the VAG Committees is hampered by several factors. Firstly, in order for a woman to be considered suitable and for her to accept the position, she needs to have a certain level of literacy and degree of confidence, both of which are not common amongst women. Women must also have time to spare from every day responsibilities, which can be rare. Secondly, due to traditional values, women may automatically nominate a male member of the community as their representative and not think of nominating a fellow woman nor consider the advantages of being represented by a woman. Thirdly, people's votes are influenced by many factors other than who they think would be best for the position, such as their family relationships. In addition a married woman would have to ask permission from her husband to become a committee member and if he thinks that such a commitment will require her time, he may refuse.

Synthesis of Findings

In a patriarchal society and a community in receipt of various externally designed, funded and managed 'development' projects, women do not tend to be self-reliant or to have the confidence to take control of their lives. Women's submissive dependency on men in the community for leadership and reliance on external agencies for initiative and new opportunities to improve aspects of their lives, are not conducive to their involvement in conservation.

Men's dominance in decision-making results in isolation of women from resource management and its benefits, reduction in the value of the stake they have in biodiversity, and poor use of women's knowledge, skill and labour resources. Without participation women will not understand and support the resource management practices promoted, nor will management regimes be sustainable without the input of the resource's everyday users. Benefits provided to encourage the conservation of a resource are only effective if they match the cost in value, reach the cost bearer and represent a benefit to the recipient. Clearly, this can only be achieved if the cost bearer's views are represented and considered in decision-making processes. If control over the resource and the ability to gain from its good management is limited, so too is the incentive to maintain it.

Some women do have the freedom to take a more active part in project activities, and some men can see the benefit of involving women, if only for manual help with construction projects. By promoting and supporting the involvement of charismatic local

women in male-dominated arenas such as decision-making, and in the development of projects for the benefit of women and the dissemination of information, all the women in the community are more likely to co-operate.

Box 9.1 Key Measures to Promote Women's Involvement in ICDPs

Policies should:

- ~Take account of the different relationships that women and men have with natural resources.
- ~Provide clear linkages between incentives/benefits and the management of the full range of natural resources and the associated costs. Thus costs are outweighed by direct, tangible benefits that are accessible to, and appreciated by, cost bearers.
- ~Inculcate a willingness and commitment to address the broad range of issues affecting the ability of the local community - particularly women's - ability to manage their resources sustainably.
- ~Provide guidelines of good practice for staff and meeting managers to enable and encourage women's participation and to promote respect for all members of the community.
- ~Implement monitoring and evaluation procedures with suitable indicators to track the progress, achievements and difficulties of promoting women's involvement in ICDPs.

Institutions and management should:

- ~Recognise that women's greater involvement leads to their better appreciation of the benefits provided; development of their skills; and potentially more valuable and sustainable community projects.
- ~Build on local community structures (which include interest groups of women) for management of natural resources; dissemination of information; and distribution, and decision-making about use, of benefits.
- ~Identify traditions that hamper women's participation and work with women to overcome the constraints they present, or find alternative approaches to participation, by building capacity, confidence and co-operation amongst groups of women.
- ~Use the most appropriate method for educational and decision-making meetings to encourage full community participation, rather than the most often used or easily replicated.
- ~Ensure that institutions are inclusive of all community members without demanding their attendance at traditional-style meetings, through representation and feedback by charismatic local women.

Support Services should:

- ~Develop partnerships with relevant agencies (donors, governments, park, NGOs) to support key activities with women.
- ~Make efforts to tackle higher-level issues of poverty, population growth, educational inequities and food security which have a direct impact on women's natural resource management.
- ~Undertake educational and awareness-raising activities.
- ~Work to create a sense of independence, self-confidence and belief amongst women.
- ~Ensure those delivering support services are well trained in working with women and aware of their needs.

Natural Resources Management should:

- ~Build on the powerful incentives for conservation that women have due to their role in the community, by working to enable them to manage natural resources well and reducing their need to exploit them.
- ~Appreciate and use women's knowledge about natural resource management and be clear about which natural resource management practices should be followed.

As key stakeholders valuing a particular set of resources, having specific impacts on resources and with certain needs, women demand special consideration. Attempting to enable and encourage women to be involved in ICDPs through a gender-specific programme can lead to isolation from other activities and contribute to dependency. However, integrating work that is aimed at promoting women's participation into all activities means responsibility is given to everyone, but is taken by no one. The importance of bringing the perspectives of women into ICDP activities and promoting their meaningful participation demands more focussed attention, such as through the use of women in roles similar to CLAs, dedicated to promoting the participation of women in ICDPs and acting to address the broad range of constraints.

Recommendations

Clearly, LIRDIP would benefit from considering the measures described in Box 9.1. In addition, a number of recommendations can be made specifically for the Project.

- A woman should be appointed in a community liaison role with the responsibility of promoting the participation of women in the ICDP.
- Training and education for community and staff to improve effectiveness and efficiency of natural resource management should be provided.
- A code of conduct should be developed with the communities for the meetings. This could highlight issues that constrain women's involvement in the meetings and raise their profile as stakeholders.
- There should be more collaboration with other organisations such as NGOs to address the broader issues affecting women's involvement in LIRDIP.

CASE STUDY 3: THE KIUNGA MARINE NATIONAL RESERVE CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT PROJECT

(Flintan, 2002)

The Kiunga Marine National Reserve Conservation and Development Project started in 1996/7 and involves a partnership between the Kenya Wildlife Service (KWS) and WWF. It focuses on the Kiunga Marine National Reserve (KMNR), which was designated in 1979 and covers 25,000 ha of which about 20,000 ha is mangrove forest. A population of 15,000 people live in the Reserve, distributed on the largest of the 51 islands, and a further 100,000 live in the surrounding areas. The majority of the population are Muslim and have lived there for all of their lives. They earn a living mainly through fishing. In the past some have also relied heavily on the sale and collection of mangrove wood, though in recent years this has been severely curtailed by the conservation policies and legislation of the Reserve.

The KMNR ICDP focuses on six areas, including:

- Habitat and fisheries management and conservation.
- Education programmes.
- Income-generating projects.
- Environmental health, including waste management.

One of its central aims is to adopt a gender sensitive approach to conservation.

The remoteness and insecurity of the Kiunga area is a constraint. It limits the number of existing and potential economic opportunities, and the high illiteracy level can make it difficult to explain the need for conservation.

Those who are more mobile tend to be divorcees and some of these can be very self-confident and even 'radical'. They, as well as the unmarried and more educated women tend, to be the most active in community development and Project activities. Traditionally women are involved in shell (mainly cowrie) collection for sale to dealers, trap-fishing for subsistence purposes and collection of mangrove firewood. In addition some women weave or dress-make or are involved in petty business. Traditionally, women are not expected to 'work', though a small number are teachers. However today, many are keen to play a more 'productive' role in the household. In general, women have a large degree of control over finances, deciding how household income is spent. The sharing of other household decisions varies from household to household. There is a feeling amongst the women that their lives have improved in recent years and that their culture and society is becoming more liberal and accommodating of their views and needs.

The Project has found some resistance from the local communities. This was partly due to past experiences of an ill-advised World Bank funded project that focussed on the formation of women's groups that were given 'hand-outs' for income-generation. The groups tended to be dominated by 3 or 4 influential or powerful women in each village who dominated decision-making processes and income distribution.

Women are not able to swim and therefore cannot help in Project fieldwork as the men do. However the women are asked to make reports of turtles and their nests. In return they are paid 500 Kenyan Shillings and are expected to care for the nest through a hatchling incentive: 20 Kenyan Shillings for each successful egg hatched and 10 for an unsuccessful one. However, the reliance of paying the community to conserve resources does question the sustainability of any conservation ethic being promoted by WWF. The organisation does recognise this and is attempting to reduce the money paid and encourage the locals to carry out such work for conservation, rather than solely financial, reasons.

A gender and participatory planning workshop led to the organisation of an annual 'Environment Day'. In September 2000, five villages participated in the World Clean Up Day and over 4,000 kg of plastic waste was collected. It is now an annual event. Local villagers have also been involved in similar days held in Mombassa that have allowed them to meet other communities and share ideas and experiences.

The ICDP has established an 'eco-friendly' handicraft project. Selected women from local villages are trained in eco-friendly handicraft production. Key rings, necklaces, bracelets, cushions, mosaic pictures and other innovative items are made from pieces of old flip-flops. The women, once trained, will act as key 'mobilisers' in the villages on their return and will be expected to carry out further trainings themselves. The women enjoy coming together for the trainings that can last up to 3-4 weeks, and it has been possible to promote a more cooperative and reciprocal culture between them. Women also make crafts, such as baskets and mats, from palms.

All the women were very happy to have the extra income and consequently feel more empowered to take a more active part within community life. The income from handicrafts is seen as a supplement rather than an alternative or replacement. However, no money is given to the community as a whole, despite encouragement by the Project staff to do so. By giving money to their villages, the women may be better supported in their work.

However, despite a number of outlets, marketing the products has proved problematic and is an area that the Project will be prioritising in the future.

Despite the enthusiasm of some, it has, in general, been difficult to mobilise the women, who tend to do things because they are asked to, particularly by the female project manager with whom they have a good relationship, rather than because they want to or feel motivated to do so themselves. In addition there has been some resistance from husbands who are unwilling to let their wives be away from home for the 3-4 week training session. To overcome this it has been useful to have a trusted, local male as a key member of the Project team, who has been able to persuade the doubting husbands that the women's attendance at the trainings is likely to benefit everyone. Despite this there have been a number of cases where husbands have not allowed their wives to attend.

Other elements of the Project are:

- Health and sanitation training.
- A girl-student's scholarship scheme.

However, though women are certainly involved in Project activities and are aware of the issues and WWF's concerns such as turtle conservation, few, if any, really understand or realise the link between the support they are getting for local development and the conservation of local natural resources. Some do, however, realise that such conservation will benefit them in the long term. This is particularly the case for those who have been involved with the Project for some years. They understand the need for sustainable use of resources and that cleaner beaches and more wildlife is likely to lead to more tourists. Making such links is fundamental for the future sustainability of the ICDP – and without this link its long-term future must be questioned.

Some of the women are also involved in a WWF-supported solar project. This works in conjunction with an international NGO - SHEP (Solar Health Education Project). The project supplies solar ovens and trains the women to use them. Between one and four cookers are given to each village. Although the cookers do certainly save firewood and relieve the labour burden of women to some degree, they are not generally used on a regular basis. In fact the women need to be coaxed and encouraged to use them. Not only are they an alien way of cooking food, and some suggested that the food did not taste as good, but also they can only be used during the dry months when there is sufficient sunshine. The cookers have to be guarded from animals – domestic and wild - and some women suggested that they actually enjoyed going with others to collect firewood: a time to get out of the village and have a gossip.

Overall, the Project has experienced a number of conflicts and problems. Many of these have centred on village and regional politics. Activities such as fund-raising have been politicised and WWF's role has been misunderstood. In addition the Project has experienced funding problems. For example the Project would have liked to have been able to hire a professional adviser on production, marketing, design, packaging and new products for the 'Eco-friendly' handicraft project. Unfortunately, there were not sufficient funds available.

Ideally the Project would like the Reserve to become self-financing. However, to do so a large amount of capacity building and investment (financial, time and other resources) is needed before this can be achieved. For the time being, markets continue to be sourced for the handicrafts, the quality of them is continuously improved and new and innovative uses of beach waste are being explored. The use of the cookers continues to be promoted and the attendance of girls at secondary school supported. In addition new partnerships with local social development groups are being sought to improve the sustainability of the Project.

CASE STUDY 4: CBNRM PROGRAMME IN NAMIBIA

(Flintan, 2001a)

Namibia has a very active and reasonably well-established CBNRM programme. This is facilitated at the highest level through the Nature Conservation Ordinance of 1975, which was amended in 1996. As a result of this amendment, the Ordinance now gives communal area farmers, as well as commercial farmers, the right to organise themselves into legal bodies called conservancies, with authority over the consumptive and non-consumptive use of wildlife and some other natural resources.

To date, some 15 communal-area conservancies have been registered and another 40-45 are being established. At the start of 2001, 7.5 million hectares of Namibia's communal area was established or developing as conservancies. In 2000, approximately N\$3.5 million² was generated by CBNRM for rural people. This rose to N\$6.1 million between October 2000 and September 2001.

The CBNRM programme involves a range of partners including USAID, the Namibian government, WWF-US, WWF-UK, DFID and Namibian NGOs including IRDNC (Integrated Rural Development for Nature Conservation). IRDNC is the main implementer of the programme.

When initial moves were made to promote CBNRM in Namibia, women were not taken into consideration, predominantly because of their lack of participation in traditional androcentric structures. They were not taking part in decision-making processes. Resource control was given to the men, with adverse consequences. The initial focus of the work of NGOs involved in CBNRM was the establishment of an all-male community game guards (CGG) programme concerned with encouraging communities to take responsibility for wildlife protection and facilitate control of problem animals.

It was then realised that there were large faults with such an approach: not least that women were neither receiving direct benefits from the project, nor playing a role within it. In addition it was realised that women were actually major resource users. Women were also major crop producers and therefore suffered greatly from any animal damage that occurred. At the same time, women had been educationally deprived and consequently had little access to cash and credit opportunities.

As a result a CRM (Community Resource Monitor) programme was initiated in 1994. Originally the women were employed to address problem animal concerns, in conjunction with the CGGs, as well as the natural resource management issues faced by women. However, it soon became clear that the primary roles of a CRM should be to organise communities and women's groups to better exploit natural resource management opportunities and to facilitate the flow of information between local users, decision-makers (at both local and regional levels) and the 'external' world, such as tourist companies and craft sellers.

Initially the CRMs focussed very much on gathering knowledge from local women on natural resource use, for example palms, grasses, trees and veld foods, and understanding the problems that women experienced with these resources. Women used techniques such as group discussions, resource maps, seasonal calendars, ranking exercises and trend matrices to collect information on who had tenure and use rights to the resources; what veld products were being used, by whom and why; the availability of markets; and the importance of the products to the household economy. The information was then used in the planning and continuing development of the project and the monitoring and promotion of sustainable use.

As the programme developed it aimed to raise the capacity of women in CBNRM activities rather than just promote gender balance (and quotas of women) within community organisations. It promoted the active participation of rural women in natural resource management by their appointment as facilitators within IRDNC and by encouraging conservancies to appoint women as CRMs.

The project is now based in three areas - Kunene and West and East Caprivi - between which there are many differences, both positive and negative. These are due to a number of reasons including the geographical and cultural contexts of the local women involved; the length of the presence of the project; and the use of slightly different management approaches within the different areas (see full report for more details).

² 1 US\$ = 9.57 N\$ on 14th November, 2001.

Exchange visits have been carried out between the different groups of CRMs, which, despite language barriers and friction between the groups, proved very successful, educational, and solidarity building.

Despite problems encountered the CRM programme has been very successful in many areas. Today there are over 35 CRM/CAs in both the Kunene and Caprivi regions. In East Caprivi there are 11 CRMs - five of whom are paid directly by IRDNC and six paid by the conservancies. IRDNC pays the CRMs approximately N\$600 per month: more than the conservancies pay.

In the future CRMs will be progressively integrated into the conservancies, who will be given guidance on planning and directing the CRMs in carrying out their duties, dealing with disciplinary issues and paying salaries. Minor adjustments in job descriptions are expected to allow the CRMs to conform to the management activities of each conservancy. As the role of CRMs has developed over the years, they now have the ability to get involved in a wide range of activities in connection with conservancy development (see Box 9.2).

In addition, many women, particularly in East Caprivi, are involved in making baskets and other crafts –there are 7 groups in 5 different villages. The groups also act as a forum for information exchange, coordination, marketing and training. The products are sold in a Craft Shop close to the women's villages as well as to outlets in Windhoek. Some problems were encountered with the original outlets for the products (see full report).

The women are paid by the craft market on a monthly basis, and for those products sold. Often the women will work to specific orders. For example one group recently received an order for 60 mats for which they would be paid approximately N\$1 per mat. The baskets are graded according to their quality. High quality, large baskets, that might take as long as 1 month (working part-time) to make, can sell for between N\$60-100. Dyes for the baskets are made from bark and shrubs (red-brown colours) growing in the local area, as well as from sorghum leaves (mauve), ash (grey) and very rusty tin cans (dark brown).

The development of the craft programme as an enterprise for women and other disadvantaged groups has led to the establishment of new revenue sources for the area. Today, approximately 700 people, in groups of about 30, are involved in making crafts, including children and one or two men. In addition some people have become involved in other enterprise developments through small credit loans from the Development Bank. Women making baskets earn on average approximately N\$250 per month. They continue to be trained in alternative methods of craft production. Palm gardens have been established to provide a sustainable source of raw materials for the crafts.

Thatch grass has always been used locally as a roofing material. However, it was rarely sold by the communities on a commercial basis, not least due to a lack of market. Despite initial problems, a number of markets have now been established for the grass, such as local tourist lodges. It is suggested that in three years the thatching grass project in Caprivi provided benefits of N\$400,000 to over 800 households. The CRMs monitor the process and prevent over-use.

A number of tourism enterprises have also been established, together with a Traditional Village and a campsite. Both men and women are involved in staffing and managing these. In addition income is received from levies on visitors at local tourist lodges and from activities such as sport hunting. Some of the conservancies are now in a position to begin distributing the money raised, which for some communities is substantial.

The women's increased role, and the recognition of that role, together with increased earnings, has had great social, as well as economic, benefits. Women now have greater confidence and self-esteem. More women contribute to meetings, decision-making processes and encourage others to do the same. Though in Caprivi the women are officially working on a part-time basis, they find themselves in much demand, which sometimes conflicts with their own personal responsibilities. However, most do not mind the extra work, as they know that it is valued and important.

There are a number of problems and constraints that compromise the success of the CRM programme. These include a continuing male domination in societies and institutions; conflicts between local food security and commercial enterprises; handing over responsibility for CRMs to conservancies; continuing problems with elephants and other wildlife; and international and local ethnic conflicts (for more details see full report). In addition there are a number of weaknesses – both past and present - to the Programme:

- Insufficient support and supervision in the early stages of the project to guide and train women in their expected roles.
- Insufficient emphasis on solving the problems that arose in the initial stages of the project.

- Having too high expectations of what CRMs could achieve in the complex socio-economic and political contexts in which they work.
- Reliance on a small number of women to hold the project together: without these women and their strengths, the project may fall apart.
- Promoting gender stereotypical roles through supporting projects for women that have always considered 'women's work'. It could be suggested that the project could do more to break such stereotyping, though it is agreed that such issues are very culturally sensitive.
- A lack of gender expertise within the organisation so that gender and women's issues have been addressed when problems have arisen and in a somewhat 'hit and miss' manner. A more planned, structured and strategic addressing of these issues may have prevented these problems from arising.
- The questionable sustainability of the project once it has been totally handed over to the conservancies.

Box 9.2 Summary of Roles of CRMs in East Caprivi

- 1. Monitoring** - tree, palm, grass and fire monitoring systems for other resources; training and monitoring systems.
- 2. Meetings** - find out resources being used (data collection); find out about resource problems.
- 3. Training in Harvesting** – e.g. methods, time; planting palm gardens.
- 4. Management** - fences; planting palms and trees (dye); weeding palm gardens.
- 5. To Support Conservancy Development:**
 - a) Registration of members.
 - b) Promote conservancy awareness - meetings about what is happening in conservancy; talk on radio about what is happening.
 - c) Social surveys - household surveys; community maps; find improved methods.
- 6. Promote Women's Involvement in CBNRM.**
 - a) Meetings about - becoming active in CBNRM; how to benefit from CBNRM (ideas); how to control veld fires; finding out problems; commission levels on crafts; men's and women's impact on natural resources.
 - b) Training - capacity building (pass on raw knowledge); pricing and grading of crafts; harvesting techniques; quality control; book-keeping; monitoring (trees, palms, grass).
 - c) Communication with CBNRM partners - establish contact with Women's Affairs; maintain links with national craft groups; strengthen influence in national CBNRM organisations; organise regular radio talks on women's involvement in CBNRM.
- 7. Coordination**
 - a) Report back to conservancy committees and traditional authorities; partners (MET, IRDNC).
 - b) Meetings - *kbuta*; Conservancy; CRM planning; partners (MET, IRDNC).
- 8. Promote Aids Awareness and Family Planning**
 - a) Training in protecting themselves - condoms, AIDs, one partner; family planning.
- 9. Support Caprivi Crafts Industry**
 - a) Training workshop; book-keeping; pricing and grading; quality control; market requirements.
 - b) Find markets for products (marketing); communication with CBNRM partners; advertising (radio, t-shirts, TV, signs); exchange visits (opportunities, ideas).
 - c) Meetings to place craft orders; improve quality; collect crafts (grade); feedback on sales.
- 10. Monitor Natural Resources**
 - a) Use: how much being harvested. Best practice: palms - leaves cut (number baskets); thatch - bundles cut (bundles sold and new roofs and sledges).
 - b) Health: how many are left; how healthy.
 - a) Other impacts: rain; wildlife; fire; other plants; livestock; cropping.

(Summary of Workshop at Kubunyana Campsite, 24th June, 2000).

However, considering what the Programme has achieved, its strengths override its weaknesses. In summary, the strengths are:

- The valuing of women's knowledge of local biodiversity.
- The use of participatory methods to collect information.

- The recognition of the inequities that exist in the local societies.
- Its attempts to change such inequities through supporting women and finding ways to improve their status and contribution to the community and household.
- Exposing women to modern life skills, roles, responsibilities and functions without forcing them to take up such things against their will.
- Its ability to build upon the traditional roles of women such as collecting grass and basket-making: both traditionally seen as 'women's work'
- Finding ways for women to improve their income and that of the household. Though the amount generated may not appear to be large, for the poorest amongst the communities it is certainly very beneficial. Reliance on income generation through products, such as baskets, means that the money/benefits can be easily returned to the producer. This proves more difficult when dividing out money/benefits from camp-sites and/or sport hunting.
- Its recognition of and ability to build upon the strong alliances that exist between women in their villages: this formed a good basis for working together on natural resource management issues.
- Its ability (though some might say luck) to choose women to lead the project who had strength, conviction and enthusiasm to continue despite problems.
- Ensuring that women take on responsibilities, e.g. for the sustainability of the natural resources that they use.
- The formation of a good communication network between women, the rest of the local communities and 'outsiders'.
- The exchange of ideas and experiences between the different groups within the project and with similar groups from other projects, e.g. through exchange trips.
- The emphasis on integrating the CRMs into conservancy management to encourage sustainability.
- An approach that focuses on 'gender mainstreaming' rather than quantitative measurements of numbers of women on committees etc.
- The provision of advice on gender issues to the project from 'outsiders'.
- The flexibility to adapt the programme to local contexts.
- Having faith that the programme will work despite the problems that have arisen.

These strengths and weaknesses are not exhaustive and, it should be recognised, result from a comparatively short study of the CRM programme. Also, as can be seen, some points can be defined as both strengths and weaknesses depending upon which angle they are looked from. This illustrates the complexity and sensitivities of the situation and suggests how difficult it is to address gender issues and support women and 'women's projects'.

There has been much criticism of the CBNRM process due to its emphasis, in the past, on large animals: usually considered the domain of men. As a result women had been marginalised and had generally 'missed out on any resultant benefits. The CRM programme, as it has evolved in the past ten years, has certainly changed this and though the project is not perfect, many positive aspects have been achieved. Women have now been drawn into the CBNRM process and are receiving benefits from it. Their roles and responsibilities have been recognised and continue to be built upon. In addition, their position within local communities has improved and their self-esteem and confidence has grown. Despite this, large challenges still exist that must be overcome. The most important of these is to ensure the sustainability of the programme in the future, particularly under conservancy management. Though firm foundations appear to be in place for doing so, how successfully this will be achieved is yet to be seen.