Report of the Budget and Finance Committee to the National Assembly

4. MINISTRY OF EDUCATION, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY

4.1 2001 Committee Recommendations (13, 14, & 15)

2002 Committee Recommendation: Substantially increase the budget for training primary school teachers, and designate the same as a Priority Poverty Expenditure.

2002 Committee Recommendation: Substantially increase the budget for personal emoluments (salaries and benefits) for teachers, and designate the same as a Priority Poverty Expenditure

2002 Committee Recommendation: Substantially increase the budget for teaching and learning materials in primary schools, and designate the same as a Priority Poverty Expenditure.

4.2 Current Status

- 4.2.1 In drafting this portion of the report, the Committee consulted with the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning, the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) that funds the Grant to Support the Education Sector (GSES), and the Private Schools Association of Malawi (PRISAM).
- 4.2.2 In addition, the Committee took note of the comments made by the Civil Society Coalition for Basic Education. This group, a coalition of 22 organizations focused on improving primary education, first commented before the Committee in 2001, as it was drafting its recommendations for Priority Poverty Expenditures.
- 4.2.3 In May 2002, the Coalition presented its current findings on the implementation of the three Priority Poverty Expenditures in primary education for the first two quarters of this financial year 2001/02. Their research was based on a nationwide survey of 51 schools in 6 districts in all three regions. The Coalition completed questionnaires at both district and school levels and it conducted a literature review and desk research at the national level. While their report is not a scientific survey, it is a systematic attempt to determine what happened with the Priority Poverty Expenditures at the grass roots. For that reason, the Committee was particularly interested in what the Coalition found.
- 4.2.4 For the three Priority Poverty Expenditures in Education, the budget allocations in 2001/02 were substantially increased over the previous year. Most of this increase is attributable to HIPC resources. If the HIPC resources are excluded, then the Malawi Government's (GoM) contribution is marginal. Table 6, gives the details of allocations from both GoM and HIPC as well as the revised totals.

Table 6: Recurrent Expenditures for Priority Poverty Expenditures
Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (in millions of
Kwacha)

Priority Poverty Expenditure	2000/01 Revised	2001/02 GOM	2001/02 HIPC	2001/02 Vote	2001/02 Projected through June	% Change
Teacher Training	61.5	63.4	285.0	348.4	305	466.5%
Teacher Salaries	1,333.0	1,492.8	433.7	1,926.6	1,502.6 ³	13%
Teaching & Learning Materials	149.8	188.3	457.0	698.4	698.4	430%

Source: Monitoring Unit of the Budget Department in the Ministry of Finance.

- 4.2.5 The allocations for these three Priority Poverty Expenditures were revised during the year and there were variances in spending. The revised total for teacher training is only slightly less than the original allotment, but the projected allocation to the Ministry through June 2002 is K305.
- 4.2.6 The original allocation for teacher's salaries was K1,926.5 million (GOM = K1,492,820 plus HIPC = K433 740). However, recent tables indicate a revised allocation of K1,502.6 million of which K1,053.6 million, or 70.1% has been funded through March 2002. The Committee wishes to have explanations for these differences.
- 4.2.7 Finally, with Teaching & Learning materials, the projected allocation through June is K698.4 million, the full amount indicated in the Budget. Projected expenditures for the months of May and June are K192 million.

4.3 Expected Outputs

- 4.3.1 The extension outputs for this financial year as reported in the Budget Document 4A are as follows:
- 4.3.2 Output for Primary Education:
- □ 2,900,000 students enrolled in the primary education system
- 4.3.3 Outputs for Tuition, Teaching & Learning Materials:
- 8 exercise books per pupil for 2,900,000 pupils
- ☐ 1 set of teaching materials per teacher for 48,333 teachers
- 4.3.4 Outputs for Teacher Education
- □ 5,160 primary teacher education graduates trained to function effectively

³ This amount is based on funding through the end of March 2002.

Report of the Budget and Finance Committee to the National Assembly

- 4.3.5 Outputs for Administration and Support:
- ☐ Salaries paid on time
- □ 5,000 primary teachers recruited

4.4 Teacher Training

Table 7: Budget Allocation for Teacher Training in 2001/02 (in thousands of Kwacha)						
	Personal Emoluments	ORT	Total Revised			
Teacher Trainin	g 27,702.7	320.7	348.4			
Source: HIPC Monitoring Unit.						

- 4.4.1 The expected output for this Priority Poverty Expenditure in this financial year is summarised in Budget Document 4A as: 5,160 primary teacher education graduates trained to function effectively in the delivery of quality primary education.⁴
- 4.4.2 Currently, one half of all primary school teachers in Malawi's schools are untrained. That number is large because, when free primary education was initiated, there were not enough qualified teachers. To address the shortage of trained teachers, the Ministry established a timetable to reduce the number of untrained teachers. This timetable, as reported in its *Policy Investment Framework* (PIF), is as follows:
- □ Reduce the number of unqualified teachers to 30% of the primary teaching force by 2002, and,
- □ Reduce the number of unqualified teachers to 10% of the primary teaching force by 2012.
- 4.4.3 Based on the Civil Society Coalition's study, only 3200 teachers have been trained using this year's budget allocation. In fact, the Teacher Training Colleges stood empty for two and one half months. The Committee crosschecked the actual allocations from the Ministry of Finance through March 2002 and established that only 21.8% of the funding for this item, or K75.8 million has been used.
- 4.4.4 The Civil Society Coalition argued that Cohort 7 of teacher trainees should be considered an output from the previous financial year because funding came from that budget (even though training was begun in this financial year). Cohort 8 entered the colleges on January 27th 2002 for 16 weeks, and is therefore the only output from the 2001/02 financial year. The Ministry will not be able to use the remaining funds because the next Cohort is scheduled to attend in the coming financial year.

22

⁴ However, the same document also states that there are to be 6,000 primary teacher education trainees enrolled in the six primary teacher training colleges.

- 4.4.5 The Ministry of Education responded that that there are indeed more than 6,000 students in training in the current financial year. This is due to an overlap of Cohort 7 (2001-September 2002) and Cohort 8 (2002-2003). According to their calculations, therefore, by September 2004 there should be 9005 trained and qualified teachers.
- 4.4.6 The other observation made by the Coalition was that, given the current rate of training new teachers, the Ministry's target of reducing the number of untrained teachers to 10% by 2015 will not be achieved until 2040.

4.5 Teachers' Salaries

- 4.5.1 Based on its survey, the Civil Society Coalition found that by including allowances with basic salary increases, teacher salaries increased by an average of 68%. This is well above the 35.5% recommended by the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning at the beginning of the year. The net increase is 37% up in real terms if we deflate the nominal increase to take care of inflation. The Coalition applauded Government for this achievement.
- 4.5.2 The Ministry of Education Science & Technology provided the current salary schedule (found below) and explained that the promise made by the State President of a carry home pay of K5,000 was fulfilled. The exception, as noted by the Civil Society Coalition, is that untrained teachers receive less than K5,000. The Ministry's position was that assistant teachers who are untrained cannot expect to receive a professional allowance. Therefore, their salaries are less than K5,000.

Table 8: New Monthly Salary Scale for Primary School Teachers (in Kwacha)						
Grade	Salary	Housing Allowance	Professional Allowance	Total		
PT1	4,758	9,000	1,000	14,758		
PT2	4,327	9,000	800	14,127		
PT3	3,325	6,000	800	10,125		
PT4	2,125	2,500	800	5,425		
TT	1,669	1,500		3,169		

4.5.3 According to Budget Document 4A, personal emoluments for primary education in 2001/02 is K2,016 million (salaries and wages equals K1,077 million plus allowances of K939 million).

4.6 Teaching and Learning Materials

- 4.6.1 Outputs for teaching and learning materials are that the Ministry would procure and distribute the following materials:
- 8 exercise books per pupil for 2,900,000 pupils; and,

Report of the Budget and Finance Committee to the National Assembly

- ☐ 1 set of teaching materials per teacher for 48,333 teachers.
- 4.6.2 A set of teaching materials consists of 15 boxes of chalk, 35 exercise books, 30 pens, 1 register, 1 blackboard duster, 2 portable chalkboards per school. According the Civil Society Coalition for Quality Basic Education, the estimated cost of 1 set is K3,120.
- 4.6.3 In conducting their research, the Coalition asked survey respondents to distinguish between materials received from Government and those received from donors. On average, 51% of all the schools surveyed received their teaching and learning materials during the first six months of this financial year. That means 49 % of the schools surveyed did not.
- 4.6.4 The survey then compared the amount of materials received over the period July-December 2001 to the number received during the previous financial year. The Coalition learned that the number of exercise books, pens, pencils and chalk increased significantly by 58%, 91%, 92% and 72% accordingly.
- 4.6.5 The Coalition's data suggests that six exercise books per pupil were delivered, which is well on the way to the budget target of eight exercise books per pupil per year. However, there is acute inequality in the distribution. Urban schools and those schools situated in an area that has a good road network received more materials than the rural and remote schools. For example, one urban school alone accounted for half of the deliveries received by all 51 schools surveyed.

		oution of Teaching and Learning Materials December 2001)					
		Exercise Books	Pens	Pencils	Chalk	Boards	Desks
Percentage Schools tha Received M	at	51%	41%	29%	47%	12%	2%

4.6.6 In response to the findings by the Civil Society Coalition, the Ministry of Education Science & Technology indicated that 49% of schools might not have received teaching and learning materials by the end of December. Civil society's survey was conducted while the Ministry's Supplies Unit was waiting for the Government Contracting Unit (GCU) to approve their distribution contracts. The Ministry states that by the second term, all teaching and learning materials had been distributed.

4.7 CIDA

4.7.1 At its May meetings, the Committee heard from a representative of the Canadian International Development Agency. She discussed that agency's program to distribute schoolbooks to Malawian children (Grant to Support the Education Sector in Malawi). This project is distributing 11.4 million textbooks, teachers' guides, and 12,000 metal storage cabinets to the 4,363 government schools in Malawi. Some 3.2 million primary school pupils will receive textbooks. The project

aims at reducing the textbook ratio from the current 1:24 (i.e. 24 pupils sharing one book) to 1:1 (one book per pupil). The distribution of the books started in January 2002 and will last six months. Through March 2002, SVM-AMI, who won the distribution contract, had already distributed textbooks to nine districts.

- 4.7.2 The average cost for printing one textbook in Canada was only C\$0.70, which translates to MK35.50. This unit cost is far lower than printing locally. The whole exercise will cost CIDA C\$12.8 million or K640 million. Total budget for the GSES Project stands at C\$15 million (about K750 million). Phase Two of the project will start sometime next year. However, that phase will concentrate on other aspects of education (developmental) and not textbooks.
- 4.7.3 The Committee wishes to applaud the Government of Canada for its efforts to assist Malawi's primary school children.

4.8 School Blocks

- 4.8.1 The Committee raised concerns that in different parts of the country, school blocks remain unfinished. Constituents are asking their MPs when construction will be finished. In some areas, the local assemblies assumed responsibility and completed these blocks. The Committee wanted to know when the Ministry intends to have these school blocks completed.
- 4.8.2 In response, the Ministry indicated that there are three categories of uncompleted school blocks. The first consists of those schools that were under investigation in the Ministry of Education scam. In those cases where the Auditor General established that the contracts awarded were standard and that there was no issues of corruption, the contractors have now been ordered to complete these projects. The second lot of blocks are those built under the World Bank funded Primary Education Project. These are the blocks whose construction was starting with the roof before the erection of the walls. Thirdly, there are some schools constructed by the Government using proceeds from privatisation. Unfortunately, the funding was exhausted before completion of the school blocks. The Ministry of Education is finally taking over to have the construction completed. The blame should therefore not be directed at the Ministry because it was initially not responsible for the whole project and its supervision.

4.9 2002 Committee Recommendations

2002 Committee Recommendation: : Increase the budget for training primary school teachers, and designate the same as a Priority Poverty Expenditure.

2002 Committee Recommendation: Maintain budget increases for personal emoluments (salaries and benefits) for teachers, and designate the same as a Priority Poverty Expenditure.

2002 Committee Recommendation: Maintain the increased budget for teaching and learning materials in primary schools, and designate the same as a Priority Poverty Expenditure.